



Publisher

<http://jssidoi.org/esc/home>



DEVELOPMENT PLANNING PECULIARITIES IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE, SOUTH AFRICA:
A CASE STUDY

Kaizer Raseane Makole ¹, Bhekabantu Alson Ntshangase ², Steven Kayambazinthu Msosa ^{3*}

¹ Tshwane University of Technology, Staatsartillerie Rd, Pretoria West, Pretoria, 0183, South Africa

^{2,3} Mangosuthu University of Technology, 511 Griffiths Mxenge Hwy, Umlazi, 4031, South Africa

E-mails: ¹ MakoleKR@tut.ac.za; ² Ntshangase.alson@mut.ac.za;

^{3*} msosa.steven@mut.ac.za (Corresponding author)

Received 10 May 2022; accepted 17 August 2022; published 30 September 2022

Abstract. The cooperative governance model espoused in the democratic South African Constitution requires the three spheres of the local, provincial and national governments to coordinate their service delivery strategies and institutional plans to strengthen efficiency, coherence and accountability toward improving performance efficacy and the quality of citizens' life. However, political and ideological contestations in a situation where different political parties are in power at national, provincial and local government levels result in the lack of alignment between the Integrated Development Plan and the National Development Plan, which denies citizens access to good quality services. This study reviewed various literature sources, governance policies and strategies to analyse whether the Integrated Development Plan of the City of Tshwane Metro Council under the governance of the multi-party coalition led by the Democratic Alliance can align with the National Development Plan, which is a creation of the African National Congress-led national government. A Qualitative approach informed the study, guided by a literature review to collate data and arrive at findings. The findings revealed a lack of alignment between the Integrated Development Plan of the City of Tshwane and the National Development Plan during the Democratic Alliance's control, which results in a disjointed approach to planning; poor implementation of local government services; and slow social-economic development that hamper the improvement of the quality of lives of citizens in Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, perpetuating societal inequalities. It is recommended that institutional and political leaders in the three spheres of government in South Africa, and the citizenry, should put 'all hands on deck' and work together for the betterment of the country, despite differences in political strategies and policy approaches.

Keywords: alignment; City of Tshwane Metro Municipality; Integrated Development Plan; National Development Plan; service delivery

Reference to this paper should be made as follows: Makole, K.R., Ntshangase, B.A., Msosa, S.K. 2022. Development planning peculiarities in the city of Tshwane, South Africa: A case study. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 10(1), 282-292. [http://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2022.10.1\(15\)](http://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2022.10.1(15))

JEL Classifications: A19, H11, H70

Additional disciplines: political sciences; public administration; economics

1. Introduction

The Democratic Alliance (DA) is a governing party in the City of Tshwane Metro Municipality and an official opposition party to the governing African National Congress (ANC) at national government level (Independent Electoral Commission, 2019). This analysis of the development planning peculiarities in Tshwane City, as run by the Democratic Alliance, is significant in order to assess how different ideological outlooks, policy directions and political agendas between the Democratic Alliance and governing African National have a bearing on the national developmental trajectory (African National Congress, 2007; National Planning Commission, 2011). The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) of a local municipality in South Africa is framed on a participatory democratic process at local government level, as promulgated in the Municipal Systems Act of 2000 to ensure that local communities are consulted to identify programmes and projects meant to improve service delivery (Republic of South Africa, 2000). Whilst the IDP process is a mandatory legal framework that enables community participation in local government planning of service deliverables, its formulation process is susceptible to challenges due to political and social contestations, thereby defeating its intended purpose of coordinating and consolidating local government services to promote and improve the quality of service delivery (Huchzemeter & Mayekison, 2003; Gauteng Provincial Government, 2006; Harrison, Skosana, 2006).

The IDP process in South Africa should be aligned to the strategic objectives and goals of the National Development Plan Vision 2030, which is a national policy guiding framework on how local governments are expected to provide and improve the quality of services when delivering electricity, waste management, water and other bulk services. Local government in South Africa is viewed as the coalface of improving the quality of citizenry's lives in an endeavour to build a capable transformational and developmental state that is responsive to addressing the triple challenges of poverty, inequality and unemployment by underscoring local socio-economic development and governance prospects (National Planning Commission, 2012; Wust, 2022). In the City of Tshwane, the Democratic Alliance (DA) is presently the governing party in the metro municipal council, while the African National Congress (ANC), which is the national governing party that spearheaded the conceptualization of the National Development Plan, is in opposition benches together with the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) and other minority parties as per the local government election of 2016 (Independent Election Commission, 2016).

This study seeks to explore how the local government in the City of Tshwane, which is controlled by the Democratic Alliance, an opposition party at the national government level, aligns the city council's Integrated Development Plan with the National Development Plan's strategic objectives and goals. Alignment of the two important strategies for the improvement of service delivery for local citizens should be irrespective of the DA's opposition to the governing ANC's policies and strategies pertaining to governance in South Africa. The study is significant due to its critical analysis that the South African government is very effective in designing policy trajectory but poor on the implementation of agreed policies at the three spheres of national, provincial and local governments where there is a plethora of poor service delivery and protests across the country (Public Service Commission, 2018; Touchston & Wampler, 2014; Twala, 2014; Alexander et al., 2022). One mechanism to streamline performance efficiency and efficacy during the fourth administration in 2014 was to establish a specialized Ministry of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation housed in the Presidency at an executive authority level to guide governance and institutional planning, as well as monitor and evaluate government's programmes and projects across all spheres of government (Department of Monitoring and Evaluation, 2015; National Planning Commission, 2012). Institutionalized pathways and developmental trajectories are necessary to achieve the strategic objectives and goals of the National Development Plan Vision 2030 (National Planning Commission, 2012).

2. Theoretical Background

2.1 Developing a rationale for the analytical inquiry

The concept of 'new' national planning is utilised to describe the new environment in which the present generation of national development planning activities is taking shape. The "new" paradigm of national planning is defined by a paradigm shift towards more closely aligning plans with election cycles and locally set goals, while nevertheless taking into account new global norms. An Integrated Development Plan (IDP) is construed as a chief planning tool for municipalities, with the intended goal of ensuring a bottom-up consultative process between the ward councillors and citizens in a particular ward to identify and propose service delivery programmes and projects (Municipal Systems Act, 2000). Service delivery priorities such as water and sanitation; roads and storm water; refuse removal; environmental planning and management, alongside the bouquet of local economic development initiatives (i.e. tourism facilitation, economic facilitation, development and growth; investment promotion; social and welfare responsibilities, including power generation, electricity distribution and management; and running a bus fleet) are identified to guide and be embedded in the IDPs of local and metro municipalities (Skosana, 2006). The IDP should therefore guide integrated planning for service delivery within local government, and be consolidated for effective service delivery programmes and projects across all municipal wards.

A practical observation from the vantage point of being at the coalface is that consultative processes normally degenerate into a political competition between community members and ward councillors influenced by party political loyalties rather than the best interests of the citizens in a municipality. A consultative process with local citizens is critical to drive and guide the IDP planning process (Republic of South Africa, 2000). Moatshe (2020) posits that due to the nature of political contestations, consultative processes for service deliverables degenerate into local political infighting characterized by a culture of disruptions which impede the IDP process. Furthermore, the failure of local ward councillors to conduct the IDP process in a mature and non-partisan manner denies community members opportunities to contribute and become service delivery partners in the planning process. Local political contestations during the development of the IDP in a ward area impact negatively on service delivery and result in a lack or poor alignment of the IDP of the City of Tshwane Metro Council with the strategic objectives and goal of the National Development Plan, which is supposed to guide the public service planning and development of the country (National Planning Commission, 2012). Moreover, a lack of skills amongst local politicians at ward and local government levels to strategically guide their communities during the development process of the Integrated Development Plan in municipalities poses serious challenges to the realisation of the strategic objectives and goals of the National Development Plan, namely building a capable state that is responsive to community needs (Moatshe, 2020).

2.2 Problematizing performance challenges within the South African local government context

The City of Tshwane Metro, under the previous leadership of the African National Congress, has made great strides in improving local institutional integrated development planning by factoring in the City Development Strategy (Manuel, 2012). However, the apartheid legacy challenges such as poor quality of service delivery and lack of economic development in poor northern areas; unreliable power supply and management; lack of safety and security; HIV-AIDS; and lack of skills development amongst local citizens are still pervasive in the City of Tshwane (Skosana, 2006; Manuel, 2012). The Democratic Alliance in the Tshwane Metro is accused of failing to supply clean water to the poor area of Hammanskraal (Moatshe, 2020; Ramokgopa, 2018). The City of Tshwane Municipality re-directed financial expenditure to maintain well-resourced areas in the east of Tshwane; is unable to maintain infrastructure in township areas such as Ga-Rankuwa, Winterveldt and Mamelodi; and lacks the ability to revitalise local economic development for job-creation for local citizens (Mail & Guardian, 2019). The current governing Democratic Alliance faces a major challenge of legitimacy amongst poor black communities in the City of Tshwane as they were not outright winners in the 2016 local government election but assumed power

by cobbling together a minority coalition government that suffered major paralysis and collapsed in March 2020 (Pretoria News, 2020). While the Democratic Alliance blames the ANC's policy of cadre deployment for poor service delivery in the three spheres of government, the Minister of Public Service and Administration rebuts the DA's policies for not being in congruence with the strategic objectives of the National Development Plan to improve the quality of lives and services for the majority of South Africans (Masuabi, 2021).

The city's growing urbanisation necessitates a focus on sustainable and smart expansion. Tshwane is the most populous and economically significant metropolitan municipality in the country. For policy analysis, the jurisdiction tends to be a well-structured administrative jurisdiction with different state-urban development rules (Kumar & Dhote, 2021). However, the Democratic Alliance in the City of Tshwane has been limping from one governance, leadership and management crisis to another as it was forced to remove two mayors; suspend a municipal manager who is the accounting officer; faced work stoppage protests from workers affiliated to the South African Municipal Workers Union; and failed to carry out programmes which impacted municipal service delivery during its term of 2016 to 2021 (Moatshe, 2020). A major challenge for the Democratic Alliance in governing the City of Tshwane Metro is mistrust by the community as it is perceived to have undone the gains of the African National Congress-led previous administration's efforts to improve the quality of life of black South Africans by being in opposition to affirmative action, employment equity and broad-based black economic empowerment policies (Democratic Alliance Manifesto, 2016). Community members in the City of Tshwane accentuate that the Democratic Alliance has positioned itself as an anti-African majority that does not align its governance policies and municipal strategies with the National Development Plan that seeks to improve the quality of life for black South Africans by creating decent jobs and improving their economic development prospects in an effort to build a capable state that is responsive to the social and economic needs of previously disadvantaged South African citizens (Ramokgopa, 2018; Masuabi, 2021).

3. Research methodology

Creswell (2014) posits that the qualitative research methodology encourages an in-depth review and analysis of data from written documentary sources like strategic plans, policy documents and textual materials like newspapers, journal articles and other documentary artefacts. Labuschagne (2003) mentions that one of the analytical methods that the researcher can employ is to identify and select relevant documents and examine them to synthesize data. Data from documents can be "organized into categories, themes and case examples using content or thematic analysis" (Angers & Machtmes, 2005:780). Additionally, Karppinen (2010) asserts that document analysis is an important data collection tool for policy and programmatic intervention improvement due to ease of access. Young (2003) reflects that social science researchers in favour of interviews and questionnaires have neglected document analysis. Atkinson and Coffey (2004:59) describe documents as "social facts that are produced, shared and used in socially organized ways". A qualitative research approach was used to source policy documents, strategic and operational plans of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Council and South African government, as well as newspapers articles to conduct an analytical description pertaining to the alignment of the Integrated Development Plan and National Development Plan. The intention is to assess whether efforts are made by the City of Tshwane Metro to deliver local government services in line with the developmental agenda of South Africa which can accrue socio-economic dividends for the local citizenry and improve their quality of life. The use of primary documentary sources was significant to gather first-hand insight into how institutional processes are generated and align to drive the societal development agenda at local and national government levels.

The literature review derived numerous themes from primary and secondary documents in order to analyse how the City of Tshwane and South Africa approach developmental planning and governance performance. The primary and secondary documentary analyses of collated data was significant to provide a picture of how the City of Tshwane aligns its strategic and pragmatic plans and activities with the National Development Plan,

which is an overarching strategy for South Africa to improve its quality-of-service provision and quest to achieve its national development goals. Document analysis focuses on written documents or materials not produced by the researcher but generated from primary and secondary sources within an institution (Bowen, 2008). Primary and secondary documents were sourced from the City of Tshwane's strategic and annual performance plans for the past 15 years; national government policies and programmes pertaining to governance and planning; journal articles and recent newspaper articles. Analysed documents were the City of Tshwane's Development Strategy by the previous African National Congress to improve local government services in the City of Tshwane; the city's annual report of 2018/2019; South Africa's diagnostic report of 2011; National Development Plan of 2012; and numerous journal and newspaper articles on the City of Tshwane. The following themes were generated: *city development strategy for the City of Tshwane by the African National Congress; developing countries' national development plans for countries' developmental pathways; adoption of the National Development Plan in South Africa to guide local government processes and performance; alignment between City of Tshwane's Integrated Development Plan and National Development Plan; and poor integrated approach to institutional planning between local and national spheres of governments in South Africa.*

4. Results and Discussion

4.1 City Development Strategy for the City of Tshwane by the African National Congress

The City of Tshwane Metro adopted the City Development Strategy (CDS) in 2004 during the ANC's governance of the metro council to coalesce institutional processes and tools with the Integrated Development Plan through their Tshwane Development Management Cycle, which seeks to enhance local service delivery activities (Skosana, 2006). The intention of the CDS, which was the brain trust of the governing African National Congress in the Tshwane Metro, was purposed to institutionalize local government planning to be responsive to community needs by improving the quality of municipal services; reducing levels of poverty in poor and neglected northern areas of the city like Soshanguve, Hammanskraal, Winterveldt, Mabopane and Ga-Rankuwa from the apartheid spatial planning legacy as they are inhabited by a majority of black people; and catering for inclusivity and equity for the improvement of living standards (After Cities Alliance, 2001). The Tshwane Development Management Cycle designed factor performance indicators in an effort to incrementalize institutional growth and learning in a manner that is innovative and coherent, and which seeks to achieve service delivery mandates guided by seven pillars, namely the development of poorer and neglected areas in the north of the city; strengthening economic activities; building social coherence; the application of sound financial planning and management fundamentals in local sectors of the economy; the development of strong municipal institutions; celebrating the municipality as a capital of the country; and monitoring the efficiency and efficacy of local services, i.e. local economic development, bulk services, water and electricity supplies, and the management of rates and utilities in local areas (Skosana, 2006).

4.2 Formulation of national development plans to frame the developmental pathways of some developing countries

In many developing countries that are on industrial development pathways, such as China, Malaysia, Ethiopia and Namibia, local government performance systems have been integrated and institutionalized within their national development plans (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). Some of these countries have developed comprehensive plans with sector indicators, such as macroeconomic, productive, economic infrastructure, social, good governance and capacity building, that drive their five-year medium-term performance strategic targets. These strategic pillars and targeted plans are further supported by the highest level of political leadership and require public participation with strong accountability measures and consequence management for poor performance and the lack of service delivery. A priori is that systems and strategy alignment between local and national governments can streamline performance and improve institutional functionality and service deliverables (Liu et al., 2022).

Logical analysis is critical to evaluate how developing countries derived elements of good practices when institutionalizing national development planning in the developmental trajectory. The Ugandan government linked its Comprehensive National Development Planning Framework with national work plans and budgets to guide short, medium and long-term planning in their 30-year vision (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). The Namibian government integrated its national plan to be driven by four strategic pillars, social transformation, economic progression, good governance and environmental sustainability, in an effort to strengthen its sustainable developmental approach (Carver, 2020, Office of the President, 2021). Furthermore, the Chinese government established the National Development and Land Reform Commission to be a central planning agency to execute state policies and involve local government to drive its developmental pathway and create prosperity for its citizenry (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). The National Vision of Malaysia was divided into five-to-ten-year developmental phases to drive waves of development in different thematic and sector areas (Lee & Chew-Ging, 2017). Moreover, the Ethiopian Comprehensive Plan embedded five-year sectoral performance indicators in their overarching national development plan, driven and supported by political leadership at the highest governmental level (Bekele & Kjosavik, 2016). These developing countries' national developmental models can assist local government in Tshwane to analyse the importance of aligning its Integrated Development Plan with the National Development Plan, which can encourage these two critical spheres of government to align service delivery and socio-economic developmental pathways rather than adopting a silo approach.

4.3 The National Development Plan in South Africa to guide local government processes and performance

South Africa's National Development Plan (NDP) is conceptualised as a blueprint for a better and promising future for South Africans that requires institutional leaders and citizens to put 'all hands on deck' and work together for the betterment of the country. The National Development Plan (NDP) emphasizes the significance of improving the abilities of local government to fulfil its transformational developmental mandate (Department of Cooperative Government and Traditional Affairs, 2018). The NDP's strategic objectives envision that Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) at the local government level should focus attention on the strategic and critical priorities of the NDP such as the improvement of spatial planning, infrastructure and basic services to improve quality and the living standards of the South African citizenry at local spheres of governance (National Planning Commission, 2012). The six strategic pillars that drive the National Development Plan in South Africa are: unity of South Africans around a common purpose; active citizenry through democratic participation; growing an inclusive economy; the need to improve capabilities; a capable and developmental state; and leadership responsibilities in resolving problems (De Lange, 2018). Deeper analysis reveals that all these six strategic pillars of the NDP are critical at the local government level to drive service delivery implementation and improvement through an Integrated Development Plan, which calls for alignment between these two institutional frameworks of governance and the management of public affairs. This means that irrespective of the political party that is governing a municipality, its IDP activities should align with the strategic priorities, objectives and goals of the NDP, notwithstanding the fact that such a party has its own different governance and service delivery strategy guided by its political and ideological outlook.

The governing African National Congress conceptualises its notion of a developmental state guided by its 2007 Strategy and Tactic policy document that framed Chapter 13 of the National Development Plan (African National Congress National Policy, 2007). A major emphasis of the National Development Plan characterises a developmental state that "brings about rapid and sustainable transformation in a country's social and economic conditions through intensive, active and effective intervention in the structural causes of economic and social under-development" (National Planning Commission Diagnostic Plan, 2011: 409). Moreover, the National Development Plan conceptualises the state as being developmental by crafting policies which are meant to lift South Africans out of poverty, create sustainable jobs, and eradicate apartheid structural and societal inequalities. This requires the developmental state to be effectively capacitated and capable to drive transformational and developmental policies by improving institutions and infrastructure for optimal economic performance. Chapter

13 of the National Development Plan provides an over-arching guiding framework relating to the successful implementation of the NDP at local, provincial and national government spheres (National Planning Commission, 2012).

The National Development Plan (NDP) advances an idea of radical economic transformation within the structure of the South African society to realize socio-economic changes and the culture of society to dismantle dispossession and exploitation (National Planning Commission, 2012). The NDP envisions a South African society where opportunities are not determined by birth, but by education, potential and ability, and hard work. The National Development Plan accentuates cooperative relationships and governance across three spheres of national, provincial and local governments that are diffused to private, labour and civil society sectors (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). A collaborative approach by the three spheres of local, provincial and national government is critical for the alignment of functions and powers, planning processes and budget allocation processes to strengthen service delivery and seamless governance which undermine bureaucratic stagnation. While national and local governments in Tshwane and across South Africa demonstrate pockets of good planning, the poor implementation and execution of policies have denied communities much needed economic development dividends and service delivery. Poor implementation and execution of policy mandates meant to drive socio-economic development and improve the quality of national and local government services resulted in the establishment of the National Planning Commission and Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation to be strategic centres of comprehensive institutional planning frameworks to drive the developmental agenda and meet the goals of a democratic society (Republic of South Africa, 2013).

4.4 Poor alignment between the City of Tshwane's Integrated Development Plan and the National Development Plan

In 2014, the South African government adopted the Medium-Term Strategic Framework (MTSF) to be a five-year implementation plan towards the achievement of the goals National Development Plan (Republic of South Africa, 2014). The MTSF intended to identify critical action plans to be undertaken in the five-year cycle of 2014-2019 across local, provincial and national government spheres which puts the country on a developmental pathway towards the achievement of the strategic objectives and goals of the National Development Plan Vision 2030. Departmental strategic plans and performance targets at all spheres of government are to accommodate and reflect performance indicators and targets set out in the Medium-Term Strategic Framework and National Development Plan (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). While there are some green shoots of progress in economic, social and local government services in some departments in the City of Tshwane, such performance progress is minuscule and uneven across the City (City of Tshwane, 2019). Poor and a lack of cooperation across multiple departments, local government and governance stakeholders characterise poor implementation and the state of governance and management. Poor performance in the City of Tshwane is a consequence of too many strategic priorities in a currently poor economic environment. Moreover, a lack of an integrated and aligned approach across departments and institutional units results in poor and ineffective information systems to track, monitor and evaluate performance as per set NDP and local government targets (Ntshangase & Msosa, 2022).

4.5 Poor integrated approach to institutional planning between local and national spheres of government in South Africa

Twala (2014) and Touchton and Wampler (2014) postulate about the lack of synergies to guide integrated planning at inter-departmental and inter-governmental levels in South Africa, which undermine abilities to meet the strategic objectives of the National Development Plan for improved services provision, job creation and building an effective and capable state. This is due to the fact that local and national governments and their institutions operate in silos and do not liaise with each other, which makes it more challenging to align service delivery provisions and the improvement of local economic development opportunities in the City of Tshwane

with identified strategic national priorities such as the provision of water and sanitation; building economic zones for job-creation; and allocating land infrastructure and bulk services for housing development (Ramokgopa, 2018; Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018). The major impediments that cripple a strategic alignment between the City of Tshwane and national government plans and strategies are political contestations, policy dichotomy and ideological discordance between the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress. One may argue that the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress have divergent roadmaps for South Africa's developmental pathway going in parallel and opposite directions. One roadmap leads to the developmental state guided by values of social democracy to liberate South Africa from its apartheid legacy, whilst the other is the neo-liberal path to maintain apartheid inequalities (African National Congress Policy Conference, 2007; Democratic Alliance Election Manifesto, 2019). Despite an intention of the National Development Plan to signify the integration and alignment of governmental and institutional planning in South Africa, government spheres at provincial and local levels persisted with institutional autonomy in their planning cycles, which failed to sequence government economic development and service delivery activities. The disjointed approach to developmental planning in the City of Tshwane and national government undermines optimal resource allocation and utilization, the consequence of which is not being able to measure and monitor government's impact on improving the lives of citizens through its developmental agenda (Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, 2018; Ramokgopa, 2018). Poor service delivery due to the lack of an integrated approach to spatial and institutional planning between the City of Tshwane and the national government dis-empowers the local populace, which in some instances results in the scapegoating of foreign nationals for the citizens' lack of jobs and economic opportunities (Mkhiza & Makau, 2018; Khoza, Mashele & Mukonza, 2021).

Conclusions

This study sought to analyse the development planning peculiarities in the city of Tshwane. The analysis from documentary sources revealed a lack of alignment between the Integrated Development Plan in the City of Tshwane and the National Development Plan during the Democratic Alliance's control, which resulted in a disjointed approach to planning; the poor implementation of local government services; and uneven social-economic development, thus hampering the improvement of the quality of life of citizens in Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality and perpetuating societal inequalities. It must be noted that the dynamics of a local area are often not understood by the national government, which prevents it from creating policies that are appropriate for that area. Thus, the functioning of local governments is under intense political pressure from the national government. The local government structure's independence might be compromised by this circumstance, which could also result in a concentration of political power. South Africa's numerous and complex development concerns need a holistic approach to preparing for the future. IDPs are essential tools for municipalities to use in identifying and addressing specific needs in both the urban and rural areas they serve. Conflicts and inefficiencies will undoubtedly arise if the national government's IDPs and those of other government domains are not coordinated or properly aligned. A municipality's planning must thus be coordinated with and supplement the national government's development plans and strategies, as well as those of other impacted municipalities. Integrated Development Planning needs to also be developed into a process that is shared across the three domains of government. Moreover, both vertical and horizontal alignment ought to be enhanced so that it is the business of everyone. This should be done whilst simultaneously making sure that the community is aware of the potential and restrictions as a result of the resources that are available. In addition, the legislative and functional establishment of municipalities as independent organisations within a contained structure and boundary does not exempt them from the fact that in order to achieve their goals and be fully effective, the municipalities' interface with the other spheres of government must be carefully managed and optimised. Integration beyond municipal lines, as well as integration across other levels of government, is essential to both the success and the successful management of the Integrated Development Plans.

References

- African National Congress. (2007). *ANC national policy conference: Report of the commission on strategy and tactics*, 30 June 2007. Gallagher Estate: ANC Publication.
- Alexander, C., Berrisford, S., Nkula-Wenz, L., Ndhlovu, D., Siame, G., Watson, V. & Zinnbauer, D. (2022). Challenges and opportunities of curbing urban corruption and building professional integrity: Experiences of planners in South Africa and Zambia. *Habitat International*, 122(102541) <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2022.102541>
- Angers, J. & Machtmes, K. (2005). An ethnographic-case study of beliefs, context factors, and practices of teachers integrating technology. *The Qualitative Report*, 10(4), 771-794.
- Atkinson, P.A., & Coffey, A. (2004). Analysing documentary realities. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research: Theory, method and practice* (2nd ed.). London: Sage.
- Bekele, Y. & Kjosavik, D. (2016). Decentralised Local Governance and Poverty Reduction in Post-1991 Ethiopia: A Political Economy Study, *Politics and Governance*, 4(4) <http://dx.doi.org/10.17645/pag.v4i4.590>
- Carver, R. (2020). Lessons for blue degrowth from Namibia's emerging blue economy. *Sustainability Science*, 15(1), 131-143. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11625-019-00754-0>
- City of Tshwane. (2019). *City of Tshwane Annual Report 2018/19*. Pretoria: City of Tshwane.
- Creswell, J.W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- Democratic Alliance. (2019). *The manifesto for change*. Bruma Lake: Democratic Alliance.
- Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. (2018). *Concept note on the NDP five year implementation plan*. Pretoria: Department of Planning, Monitoring & Evaluation.
- Department of the Presidency. (2015). *National Development Plan 2030, Our Future make it works*. Pretoria: National Planning Commission.
- Gauteng Provincial Government. (2006). Available at <http://www.tshwane.org.za> (Accessed on March, 14 2022).
- Harrison, P., Huchzermeter, M., & Mayekison, M. (2003). *Confronting fragmentation: Housing and urban development in a democratizing society*. Cape Town: UCT Press.
- Independent Electoral Commission. (2016). *Detailed result data: 2016 Municipal election*. Centurion: Independent Electoral Commission.
- Karppinen, K. (2010). *Rethinking media pluralism. A critique of theories and policy discourses*. Ph.D. thesis. Helsinki: University of Helsinki.
- Khoza, H.H., Mashele, R., & Mukonza, R.M. (2021). The “butterfly effects” that emerged to xenophobia outbreaks in South Africa: Xenophobia, a timeless boom. *African Journal of Peace and Conflict Studies*, 10(1), 101-122. <https://doi.org/10.31920/2634-3665/2021/v10n1a5>
- Kumar, S. & Dhote, K.K. (2021). A grounded theory approach for the assessment of urban development policies in Indian cities. *Current Science*, 121(12), 1561-1571 <http://doi.org/10.18520/cs/v121/i12/1561-1571>
- Labuschagne, A. (2003). The Qualitative Report Qualitative Research -Airy Fairy or Fundamental? *The Qualitative Report*, 8 (1), 100-103. <http://doi.org/10.2514/6.1986-1409>
- Lee, C., & Chew-Ging, L. (2017). The evolution of development planning in Malaysia. *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*, 436-461. <https://doi.org/10.1355/ae34-3b>

Liu, W.W., Liu, Z.W., Wang, L., Liu, H.M., & Wang, Y (2022). Regional Social Development Gap and Regional Coordinated Development Based on Mixed-Methods Research: Evidence from China. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13 (927011) <http://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.927011>

Masuabi, Q. (2021). *Mchunu: Cadre deployment myth is a DA hype*. City Press, April 19, 2021. Johannesburg: Media24.

Moatshe, R. (2020). *Governance crisis in City of Tshwane*. March 2, 2020. IOL. Johannesburg: Independent Media.

National Planning Commission. (2012). *National Development Plan 2030: Our Future-Make It Work*. Pretoria: National Planning Commission.

Ntshangase, B.A., & Msosa, S.K. (2022). Enhancing service delivery for Metropolitan municipalities in South Africa via Project Management. *Insights into Regional Development*, 4(3), 127-138. [http://doi.org/10.9770/IRD.2022.4.3\(8\)](http://doi.org/10.9770/IRD.2022.4.3(8))

Ramokgopa, K. (2018). *Leadership in establishing the Gauteng city-region: The case of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality*. Doctorate in Public Affairs thesis. Pretoria: University of Pretoria.

Office of the President. 2021. Namibia's Second Voluntary National Review Report on the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals towards Agenda 2030. Available online: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/279462021_VNR_Report_Namibia.pdf (Accessed 10 March 2022).

Republic of South Africa. (2000). *Municipal Systems Act, No. 32*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Skosana, A. (2006). *A transformational city development strategy*. 4th ISO Carp Congress.

Twala, C. (2014). The African National Congress (ANC) and the Cadre Deployment Policy in the Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Product of Democratic Centralisation or a Recipe for a Constitutional Crisis? *J Soc Sci*, 41(2), 159-165. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09718923.2014.11893352>

Touchton, M. & Wampler, B. (2014). Improving social well-being through new democratic institutions. *Comparative Political Studies*, 47(10), 1442–1469. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414013512601>

Wust, F. (2022). The South African IDP and SDF contextualised in relation to global conceptions of forward planning - A review. *Town and Regional Planning*, 80, 54-65. <http://doi.org/10.18820/2415-0495/trp80i1.6>

Young, T.K. (2003). Review of research on aboriginal populations in Canada: relevance to their health needs. *Bmj*, 327(7412), 419-422. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.327.7412.419>

Author Contributions: Conceptualization: *Makole, Ntshangase*; methodology: *Makole, Ntshangase; Msosa*; data analysis: *Makole*, writing—original draft preparation: *Makole, Ntshangase, Msosa*; writing; review and editing: *Msosa, Ntshangase*; visualization: *Msosa*. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Kaizer Raseane MAKOLE is a PhD candidate in the Public Administration and Economics Department at the Tshwane University of Technology. Kaizer's research interests lie in Public Governance and Management, Strategic planning and Management, Organizational Behaviour & Development, Change Management Processes, Project Management & Implementation and Service Delivery Improvement.

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5860-2336>

Bhekabantu A. NTSHANGASE is the Acting Dean of the Faculty of Management Sciences at the Mangosuthu University of Technology. Dr Ntshangase's research interests include Public Administration, Service Delivery, Public-private Partnerships, Land Reform and Management, Cooperative and Entrepreneurship.

ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5410-7036>

Steven Kayambazinthu MSOSA is a Research Fellow and Lecturer in the Marketing Department at the Mangosuthu University of Technology. His research interests are Corporate Social Responsibility, Service Delivery, Sustainability, Service Failure, Higher Education Marketing, Multilevel Marketing, Relationship Marketing and Integrated Marketing Communication.

ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9074-5644>

Copyright © 2022 by author(s) and VsI Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Center

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY).

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

